

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

CITY OF DAVENPORT, IOWA

TUESDAY, SEPTEMBER 14, 2021; 5:00 PM

POLICE DEPARTMENT, 416 NORTH HARRISON STREET, COMMUNITY ROOM

I. Call to Order

Chairperson McGivern called the meeting to order.

Present: McGivern, Franken, Sage, Miranda, and Lesthaghe

Excused: Powers and Wilga

Staff Present: Laura Berkley, Matt Werderitch, Jake Ralfs

II. Secretary's Report

A. Consideration of the August 10, 2021 Meeting Minutes.

Motion by Sage, second by Franken to approve the August 10, 2021 meeting minutes.
Minutes were unanimously approved by voice vote (5-0).

III. Communications

A. National Alliance of Preservation Commissions Workshops

Werderitch announced the conference originally planned in Van Horne, Iowa on October 2nd has been postponed. The conference will be rescheduled to a later date in a virtual format. More details will be shared when they become available.

IV. Old Business

A. Case COA21-08: Request for exterior alteration of the Friederich Hartmann House located at 604 West 5th Street. Hamburg Local Landmark Historic District. Brett McCausland of Bush Construction, petitioner, on behalf of Dr. Tonia Rogers. [Ward 3]

Werderitch reviewed the Historic Preservation Commission's decision to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for the following project components at 604 West 5th Street at its August 10, 2021 meeting:

1. The structural area of rescue above the east porch and proposed building materials.
2. The deck and fire escape addition to the west building elevation with submitted building materials. (brick, composite flooring, aluminum railings, composite fascia boards, and PVC column wraps)
3. The installation of a new door on the second floor of the non-historic addition.

The Historic Preservation Commission voted to table the two second floor window conversions on the east porch and west deck addition at its August 10, 2021 meeting.

The purpose was to provide the applicant with additional time to explore window options that fit the existing openings while still enabling safe egress from the structure in the event of an emergency.

Representatives of Bush Construction and the property owner were in attendance to speak on behalf of the proposed exterior alterations. The applicant requested the Commission reconsider the originally submitted custom door designs. No additional information was provided for review. Commissioners stated their desire to preserve the existing window openings and historic brick material.

Staff cannot recommend approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness to convert the two second floor windows into doors on the east porch and west deck addition. Removing original brick on a historic structure is discouraged.

Staff stated the project was reviewed for conformance with the Standards for Review, Chapter 14.01.060 C and D of the Davenport Municipal Code. The alteration of the window openings on the historic brick portion of the structure fail to comply with the following standards:

- New additions and related new construction shall not be discouraged when such improvements do not destroy historic material and such design is compatible with the size, massing, scale, color, materials and character of the property, neighborhood and district, if applicable.
- The proportions (width versus height relationship) between doors and windows should be compatible, if not replicated, with the architectural design and character of the designated property.

Motion by Miranda, second by Sage to deny the following project components listed in the Certificate of Appropriateness application:

1. Removal of the existing window above the east porch. A door to be installed in its place that would extend down to the finished second floor for access to the area of rescue.
2. Removal of the existing second floor window above the proposed west deck addition. A door to be installed in its place that would extend down to the finished second floor for access to the deck addition.

Motion to deny the Certificate of Appropriateness Application passed by a roll call vote (5-0).

V. New Business

- A. Case COA21-20: Request for the construction of a freestanding deck and gazebo in the rear yard at 723 Brown Street. The home is located within the Hamburg Local Landmark Historic District. Craig Canfield, petitioner. [Ward 3]

Werderitch provided an overview of the proposed freestanding deck and redwood gazebo. The structures will not be visible from the public right-of-way, thereby having a minimal impact on the historic district. Craig Canfield was in attendance to answer questions.

Staff made a recommendation to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a freestanding deck and gazebo at 723 Brown Street in accordance with the submitted material.

The project was reviewed for conformance with the Standards for Review, Chapter 14.01.060C and D of the Davenport Municipal Code. The project meets the following standards:

1. New additions and related new construction shall not be discouraged when such improvements do not destroy historic material and such design is compatible with the size, massing, scale, color, materials and character of the property, neighborhood and district, if applicable.
2. Site improvements. Landscaping and other site improvements, including off-street parking, should have as minimal of an impact as possible to the designated property's original plan/layout and its visual character.

Motion by Franken, second by Lesthaghe to approve staff recommendation for approval of Case COA21-20. Motion to approve staff recommendation passed by a roll call vote (5-0).

- B. Case COA21-21: Request for repair of the existing retaining wall and site improvements at 512 East 6th Street. The Henry H. Smith-J.H. Murphy House is a locally listed historic landmark. Donna Martin, petitioner. [Ward 3]

Werderitch summarized the preservation of the existing parged limestone retaining wall. The applicant appeared before the Commission at their July 13, 2021 Work Session. Since that time, Staff have met with the applicant on site to discuss methods for preservation. Donna Martin, petitioner, was in attendance to answer questions.

Staff made a recommendation to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for the repair of the existing retaining wall and site improvements at 512 East 6th Street in accordance with the submitted material, subject to the following condition:

1. The Public Works Department shall have final approval over any work within the public right-of-way.
2. No wall projections are permitted into the public right-of-way.

The retaining wall and site improvements were reviewed for conformance with the Standards for Review, Chapter 14.01.060C and D of the Davenport Municipal Code. The project meets the following standards:

- Every reasonable effort shall be made to make the minimal number of changes necessary to maintain a designated property in a good state of repair, thereby minimizing the impact of the proposed alteration;
- New additions and related new construction shall not be discouraged when such improvements do not destroy historic material and such design is compatible with the size, massing, scale, color, materials and character of the property, neighborhood and district, if applicable.

- Site improvements. Landscaping and other site improvements, including off-street parking, should have as minimal of an impact as possible to the designated property's original plan/layout and its visual character.

Motion by Lesthaghe, second by Miranda to approve staff recommendation for approval of Case COA21-21 with the two listed conditions. Motion to approve staff recommendation and conditions passed by a roll call vote (5-0).

VI. Other Business

Werderitch updated the Commission on the status of 511 Gaines Street.

VII. Open Forum for Comment

VIII. Adjourn

Motion by Sage, second by Franken to adjourn the meeting. Motion passed by a voice vote (5-0). The meeting adjourned at 6:15 pm.

IX. Next Commission Meeting: October 12, 2021