

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

CITY OF DAVENPORT, IOWA

TUESDAY, AUGUST 10, 2021; 5:00 PM

CITY HALL, 226 W 4TH ST, COUNCIL CHAMBERS

I. Call to Order

Chairperson McGivern called the meeting to order.

Present: McGivern, Franken, Sage, Powers, and Miranda

Excused: Wilga, Lesthaeghe

Staff Present: Laura Berkley, Matt Werderitch, Jake Ralfs

II. Secretary's Report

A. Consideration of the July 13, 2021 Meeting Minutes.

Motion by Franken, second by Sage to approve the June 8, 2021 meeting minutes.

Minutes were unanimously approved by voice vote (5-0).

III. Communications

A. National Alliance of Preservation Commissions Workshops

Werderitch announced the conference will take place in Van Horne, Iowa on October 2nd. Commissioners should contact City staff if interested in attending.

Werderitch also updated the Commission on the progress of the masonry work being performed at 1208 Main Street.

IV. Old Business

V. New Business

A. Case COA21-08: Request for exterior alteration of the Friederich Hartmann House located at 604 West 5th Street. Hamburg Local Landmark Historic District. Brett McCausland of Bush Construction, petitioner, on behalf of Dr. Tonia Rogers. [Ward 3]

Werderitch introduced the case and discussed the progress made since this item was first introduced to the Commission at the May 11, 2021 Work Session. Representatives of Bush Construction and the property owner were in attendance to speak on behalf of the proposed exterior alterations. Custom doors are proposed to match the existing window design.

Commissioners questioned the need for a fire escape and setting a precedent for future cases. Ralfs stated residential building code only requires one exit door per home. Bedrooms are required to have at least one egress window.

Jeffrey Gomez, 630 West 5th Street, spoke in opposition to the proposed window conversions citing irreversible damage to the historic brick exterior.

Chairperson McGivern questioned the PVC material proposed for the column wraps on the west deck addition. Commissioner Sage recommended using a darker color for the fascia and column wraps.

Staff made a recommendation to approve the following project components and materials as presented in the Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness at 604 West 5th Street:

1. The structural area of rescue above the east porch and proposed building materials.
2. The deck and fire escape addition to the west building elevation with submitted building materials. (brick, composite flooring, aluminum railings, composite fascia boards, and PVC column wraps)
3. The installation of a new door on the second floor of the non-historic addition.

Staff made a recommendation to table the two second floor window conversions on the east porch and west deck addition. The purpose is to allow the applicant additional time to explore window options that fit the existing openings while still enabling safe egress from the structure in the event of an emergency. Extending the height of the opening by removing brick down to the finished second floor will destroy the historic brick and cause irreversible alteration to the building.

Motion by Franken, second by Sage to accept staff recommendation for Case COA21-08. Motion to approve staff recommendation passed by a roll call vote (5-0).

- B. Case COA21-17: Request for installation of new windows at 630 West 5th Street. The John Ruch House is located within the Hamburg Local Landmark Historic District. Duane Timm, petitioner. [Ward 3]

Werderitch provided an overview of the proposed window replacements. Duane Timm and Jeffrey Gomez were in attendance to answer questions.

Staff made a recommendation to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness to install seven new windows at 630 West 5th Street in accordance with the submitted material.

The project was reviewed for conformance with the Standards for Review, Chapter 14.01.060C of the Davenport Municipal Code. The project meets the following standards:

- a. Deteriorated architectural features should, where possible, be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture and other visual

qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical or pictorial evidence.

- b. The proportions (width versus height relationship) between doors and windows should be compatible, if not replicated, with the architectural design and character of the designated property.

Motion by Powers, second by Miranda to approve staff recommendation for approval of Case COA21-17. Motion to approve staff recommendation passed by a roll call vote (5-0).

- C. Case COA21-18: Request for reconstruction of the east porch at 1208 Main Street. The J. Monroe Parker-Ficke House is a locally designated historic landmark and located within the College Square Historic District. Casey Haas, petitioner, on behalf of Delt 100 Alumni Counsel LLC. [Ward 3]

Werderitch provided an overview of the proposed east porch reconstruction. The applicant appeared before the Commission at their April 13, 2021 Work Session. Since that time, Staff have met with the applicant on site to discuss methods for preservation. Architect, Greg Gowey of Studio 483, was hired to prepare plans for the reconstruction. Casey Haas, petitioner, was in attendance to answer questions.

Commissioners inquired about the proposed porch floor board material, durability, and dimensions.

Staff made a recommendation to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness to reconstruct the east porch at 1208 Main Street in accordance with the submitted materials.

The project was reviewed for conformance with the Standards for Review, Chapter 14.01.060C of the Davenport Municipal Code. The project meets the following standards:

- c. Every reasonable effort shall be made to make the minimal number of changes necessary to maintain a designated property in a good state of repair, thereby minimizing the impact of the proposed alteration.
- d. Deteriorated architectural features should, where possible, be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical or pictorial evidence.
- e. Materials. Historic or original architectural features, or replacement elements which in all ways replicated the original, should be repaired whenever possible.

Motion by Franken, second by Powers to approve staff recommendation with the following condition: The dimensions of the PVC tongue and groove porch flooring shall be submitted to City Staff for review and approval. Floor board dimensions shall be consistent with the Second Empire architectural style and those used during its original construction in 1881. Motion to approve staff recommendation and added condition passed by a roll call vote (5-0).

- D. Case COA21-19: Request for the installation of a new roof at 511 Gaines Street. Hamburg Local Landmark Historic District. Jonathan Pham, petitioner. [Ward 3]

Staff provided an overview of the proposed roof replacement. The City issued a Notice and Order to the owner to make repairs to the exterior of the structure, which is in a state of severe deterioration. The owner, Jonathan Pham, was in attendance to answer questions.

A recommendation is made to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness to install a new roof at 511 Gaines Street in accordance with the submitted material.

The project was reviewed for conformance with the Standards for Review, Chapter 14.01.060C of the Davenport Municipal Code. The project meets the following standards:

- a. Every reasonable effort shall be made to make the minimal number of changes necessary to maintain a designated property in a good state of repair, thereby minimizing the impact of the proposed alteration.
- b. Deteriorated architectural features should, where possible, be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical or pictorial evidence.

Motion by Powers, second by Franken to approve staff recommendation for approval of Case COA21-19. Motion to approve staff recommendation passed by a roll call vote (5-0).

VI. Other Business

A. Pending Items and Updates

Werderitch updated the Commission on the status of the historic retaining wall at 512 East 6th Street.

VII. Open Forum for Comment

A resident at 521 West 6th Street spoke under public comment to express the need for reinvestment in Davenport's historic neighborhoods.

VIII. Adjourn

Motion by Sage, second by Powers to adjourn the meeting. Motion passed by a voice vote (5-0). The meeting adjourned at 6 pm.

IX. Next Commission Meeting: September 14, 2021