

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

CITY OF DAVENPORT, IOWA

TUESDAY, MAY 9, 2023; 5:00 PM

CITY HALL | 226 WEST 4TH STREET | COUNCIL CHAMBERS

I. Call to Order

Chairperson McGivern called the meeting to order.

Present: McGivern, Franken, Miranda, Hustedde, Powers, Kretz

Staff Present: Werderitch, Koops, Warner, Ralfs

II. Secretary's Report

A. Consideration of the April 11, 2023 meeting minutes.

Motion by Hustedde, second by Miranda, to approve the April 11, 2023 meeting minutes. Minutes were unanimously approved by voice vote (6-0).

III. Communications

IV. Old Business

V. New Business

A. Case COA23-17: Request for exterior alteration at 321 West 6th Street. The Henry and Julia (Tritchler) Frahm House is a contributing building in the Hamburg Local Landmark Historic District. Terry Genz, petitioner. [Ward 3]

Werderitch summarized the request to repair the front limestone steps, restore the yankee gutters, replace basement windows, and rehabilitate the balcony posts and ceiling.

The applicant, Terry Genz, was in attendance to answer questions. Carver Custom Millwork will replicate the windows and balcony posts using wood materials to match the historic characteristics of the home.

Staff recommended approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alteration at 321 West 6th Street in accordance with the submitted material.

The project was reviewed for conformance with the Standards for Review, Chapter 14.01.060 C of the Davenport Municipal Code. The project meets the following standards:

1. Every reasonable effort shall be made to make the minimal number of changes necessary to maintain a designated property in a good state of repair, thereby minimizing the impact of the proposed alteration.

2. Deteriorated architectural features should, where possible, be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical or pictorial evidence.

Motion by Franken, second by Kretz, to approve Case COA23-17. Motion to approve passed by a roll call vote (5-0).

- B. Case COA23-18: Request to install new windows at 1208 Main Street. The J. Monroe Parker-Ficke House is a locally designated historic landmark and located within the College Square Historic District. CJ Haas Home Construction, petitioner, on behalf of Delt 100 Alumni Counsel LLC. [Ward 3]

Werderitch presented the history of the property and previous Certificate of Appropriateness Applications. Staff summarized the request to replace all historic windows with new white vinyl replacements. The applicant decided not to pursue preservation or fully document the need for replacement. Therefore, the vinyl windows were compared with the historic wood windows to determine whether the design, material, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Staff concluded that the vinyl windows were an inappropriate substitute material as it does not convey the same appearance as wood windows.

Casey Haas, CJ Haas Home Construction, spoke on behalf of the property owner and addressed questions relating the replacement window product. Sarah Oberg Ramirez, Lane & Waterman LLP, read a prepared statement citing economic hardship as rationale for the vinyl replacement windows. Dr. Hennan of Delt 100 Alumni Council LLC, spoke about the aesthetics of the replacement windows and the state of deterioration.

Commissioners questioned whether efforts were made to pursue historic grants or tax credits to mitigate the costs of rehabilitation. Commissioners also inquired about deferred maintenance which led to the deteriorated condition of the windows.

Warner advised the Commission how to appropriately make a motion.

Staff recommended denial of the Certificate of Appropriateness to install new windows at 1208 Main Street.

The project was reviewed for conformance with the Standards for Review, Chapter 14.01.060 C of the Davenport Municipal Code. The project does not comply with the following standard:

1. Deteriorated architectural features should, where possible, be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical or pictorial evidence.

Motion by Hustedde, second by Franken, to approve Case COA23-18. Motion to approve failed by a roll call vote (0-6). Case COA23-18 was thereby denied.

- C. Case COA23-19: Exterior alteration at 705 Gaines Street. The Lois P. Best Apartments is listed as a contributing structure in the Hamburg Local Landmark Historic District. Marion Meginnis, petitioner. [Ward 3]

Werderitch explained the structural repairs planned for 705 Gaines Street. The project received historic tax credits to address issues with the foundation. Staff believe the proposed work will keep the property in a good state of repair and will have minimal impact to the historic character of the structure.

Marion Meginnis, petitioner, was in attendance to answer questions.

Staff recommended approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alteration at 705 Gaines Street in accordance with the submitted material.

The project was reviewed for conformance with the Standards for Review, Chapter 14.01.060 C of the Davenport Municipal Code. The project meets the following standard:

1. Every reasonable effort shall be made to make the minimal number of changes necessary to maintain a designated property in a good state of repair, thereby minimizing the impact of the proposed alteration.

Motion by Powers, second by Miranda, to approve Case COA23-19. Motion to approve passed by a roll call vote (6-0).

- D. Case COA23-20: Request for exterior alteration at 713 West 7th Street. The John and Louise Boldt House is a contributing building in the Hamburg Local Landmark Historic District. Joseph Erenberger, petitioner. [Ward 3]

Werderitch outlined the scope of the DREAM Plus project, which is to replace eight windows on the front façade. The replacement Pella Reserve windows are wood with a clad exterior. The proposed wood windows are similar in design, dimension, and texture to the original windows being replaced.

Joseph Erenberger, petitioner, was in attendance to answer questions.

A recommendation is made to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alteration at 713 West 7th Street in accordance with the submitted material.

The project was reviewed for conformance with the Standards for Review, Chapter 14.01.060 C of the Davenport Municipal Code. The project meets the following standards:

1. Deteriorated architectural features should, where possible, be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture and other visual

qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical or pictorial evidence.

2. The proportions (width versus height relationship) between windows should be compatible, if not replicated, with the architectural design and character of the designated property.

Motion by Powers, second by Franken, to approve Case COA23-20. Motion to approve passed by a roll call vote (6-0).

VI. Other Business

A. 2023 Preserve Iowa Summit

B. Party in the Park

The Commission decided to participate at the June 15th event in Lafayette Park and the August 10th event at Garfield Park.

VII. Open Forum for Comment

VIII. Adjourn

Motion by Hustedde, second by Kretz, to adjourn the meeting. Motion passed by a voice vote (6-0). The meeting adjourned at 5:53 pm.

IX. Next Commission Meeting: June 13, 2023