

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

CITY OF DAVENPORT, IOWA

TUESDAY, MARCH 14, 2023; 5:00 PM

DAVENPORT POLICE DEPARTMENT | 416 N HARRISON STREET | COMMUNITY ROOM

I. Call to Order

Chairperson McGivern called the meeting to order.

Present: McGivern, Franken, Miranda, Hustedde, Powers

Excused: Higgins

Staff Present: Werderitch, Ralfs, Gleason

II. Secretary's Report

A. Consideration of the February 14, 2023 meeting minutes.

Motion by Powers, second by Miranda, to approve the February 14, 2023 meeting minutes. Minutes were unanimously approved by voice vote (5-0).

III. Communications

A. Upcoming SHPO Presentation: Windows in Historic Buildings

Werderitch announced the Iowa State Historic Preservation Office will visit Davenport on March 21st at 5pm in the City Hall Council Chambers to give a presentation on historic windows.

IV. Old Business

V. New Business

A. Case DNRHP23-03: Request for demolition of the Children's Living Unit (Building F) at 2800 Eastern Avenue. The Children's Living Unit is a non-contributing structure in the Iowa Soldiers' Orphan's Home Historic District. City of Davenport, petitioner. [Ward 5]

Werderitch provided an overview of the request to demolish the noncontributing building. The City performed a Condition Assessment Study at the Annie Wittenmyer Complex. Following the completion of the study, the building's fire suppression system failed causing significant flooding. The structure was under several feet of water, which covered the building's mechanical and electrical equipment. It is estimated that the cost to rehab the building back to its preflood condition is approximately \$150,000. This would not cover the improvements identified in the Condition Assessment Study.

If preserved, the building must also be retrofitted to meet current building, fire, mechanical, electrical, and ADA codes. The total costs of rehabilitation are likely to meet or exceed the assessed value of the building.

Gleason addressed Commissioner's questions pertaining to the future use of the Iowa Soldier's Orphan's Home Historic District.

Staff believed there was sufficient evidence to recommend approval of the demolition request. However, if the Commission desired additional information the item could be tabled to the April 11, 2023 Historic Preservation Commission meeting.

Motion by Franken, second by Miranda, to approve Case DNRHP23-03. Motion to approve passed by a roll call vote (5-0).

- B. Case DNRHP23-04: Request for demolition of 431 West 8th Street. The Michael J. and Anna Healey House is a non-contributing building in the Hamburg Historic District. City of Davenport, petitioner. [Ward 3]

Staff discussed the Development and Neighborhood Services Department letter issued on February 2, 2018. The Commission reviewed the unresolved violations resulting in the request for demolition. Abutting property owners spoke in favor of the demolition. Commissioners inquired about the timeline for demolition and process.

Staff believed there was sufficient evidence to recommend approval of the demolition request. However, if the Commission desired additional information the item could be tabled to the April 11, 2023 Historic Preservation Commission meeting.

Motion by Hustedde, second by Miranda, to approve Case DNRHP23-04. Motion to approve passed by a roll call vote (5-0).

- C. Case COA23-10: Request for exterior alteration at 714 Gaines Street. The Postel Rental House is a contributing building in the Hamburg Local Landmark Historic District. Xaveria Mayes, petitioner. [Ward 3]

Werderitch outlined the request to reconstruct the deteriorated front porch, install five new windows, and to replace a rear entry door. The application was missing details on building materials associated with the front porch.

The property owner, Xaveria Mayes, and contractor, Wayne Brewer, were in attendance to answer questions about the project scope and to clarify building materials. Commissioners discussed each element in detail with the petitioner.

Staff recommended approval of the installation of replacement windows identified in the Certificate of Appropriateness at 714 Gaines Street.

Staff recommended tabling the reconstruction of the front porch and installation of the rear door to the April 11, 2023 Historic Preservation Commission meeting to allow the applicant additional time to submit detailed information.

The project was reviewed for conformance with the Standards for Review, Chapter 14.01.060 C of the Davenport Municipal Code. The installation of new windows meets the following standards:

1. Every reasonable effort shall be made to make the minimal number of changes necessary to maintain a designated property in a good state of repair, thereby minimizing the impact of the proposed alteration.
2. Deteriorated architectural features should, where possible, be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical or pictorial evidence.

Motion by Powers, second by Franken, to approve, approve with one condition, and table the following project components identified in Case COA23-10:

1. Motion to Approve: The installation of five new windows as submitted.
2. Motion to Approve with one Condition: The replacement of the rear entry door, subject to the following condition:
 - a. The Commission directed the applicant to select an alternative door that better resembles the design, pattern, or material of the existing door. The alternative door is to be reviewed and approved by City staff.
3. Motion to Table: The reconstruction of the front porch. The purpose is to provide the applicant with additional time to select building materials and clarify construction details. Based on the discussion at the March 14th meeting, the Commission provided the following comments:
 - a. The Commission is supportive of PVC porch columns if the massing, scale, size, and visual appearance is consistent with the existing square columns.
 - b. The Commission was not opposed to the composite decking floor boards. However, a suggestion was made to select boards without a wood grain pattern.
 - c. The Commission suggested floor boards be installed in the same orientation as the existing porch flooring.
 - d. The Commission wanted further clarification on the material, style, and dimensions of the porch railings and balusters. To the greatest extent possible, the selected product should match the proportions and dimensions of the existing materials.

Motion to approve, approve with one condition, and table the items as described above passed by a roll call vote (5-0).

- D. Case COA23-11: Request to reconstruct the front porch at 729 Western Avenue. The Carl and Minnie (Eldridge) Schlegel House is a contributing building in the Hamburg Local Landmark Historic District. Mary Houston, petitioner. [Ward 3]

Werderitch presented the project scope. The property owner received funding from the DREAM Plus Program to reconstruct the deteriorated front porch. All materials and

characteristics of the porch will be of like kind. The contractor will use evidence from the existing porch to best replicate the proportions, detailing, and materials for the reconstruction.

Commissioners were supportive of the design and building materials.

Staff recommended approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness to reconstruct the front porch at 729 Western Avenue in accordance with the submitted material.

The project was reviewed for conformance with the Standards for Review, Chapter 14.01.060 C of the Davenport Municipal Code. The project meets the following standards:

1. Deteriorated architectural features should, where possible, be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical or pictorial evidence
2. New additions and related new construction shall not be discouraged when such improvements do not destroy historic material and such design is compatible with the size, massing, scale, color, materials and character of the property, neighborhood and district, if applicable.

Motion by Miranda, second by Franken, to approve Case COA23-11. Motion to approve passed by a roll call vote (5-0).

- E. Case COA23-12: Request to install a new roof at 6035 Northwest Boulevard. The John Littig House is a locally listed historic landmark. City of Davenport, petitioner. [Ward 8]

Werderitch described the proposal to install a new asphalt shingle roof at the John Littig House. The replacement shingle will match the existing gray tone shingles on the property. There are no proposed alterations to the fascia, soffit, or gutters. The historic character of the Littig House will remain intact following the reroofing project.

Betsy Tubbs, Parks and Recreation Department, was in attendance to answer questions.

Staff recommended approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness to install a new roof at 6035 Northwest Boulevard in accordance with the submitted material.

The project was reviewed for conformance with the Standards for Review, Chapter 14.01.060 C and D of the Davenport Municipal Code. The project meets the following standards:

1. Every reasonable effort shall be made to make the minimal number of changes necessary to maintain a designated property in a good state of repair, thereby minimizing the impact of the proposed alteration.
2. Deteriorated architectural features should, where possible, be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture and other visual

qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical or pictorial evidence

Motion by Powers, second by Hustedde, to approve Case COA23-12. Motion to approve passed by a roll call vote (5-0).

- F. Case COA23-13: Request to install a new roof at 630 East 7th Street. The Antoine LeClaire House is a locally listed historic landmark. City of Davenport, petitioner. [Ward 3]

Werderitch presented the request to install a new roof on the Antoine LeClaire House. The new roof material is standing seam architectural metal. The roofing product is UNA-CLAD UC-14 panel by Elevate. The color 'Terra Cotta' has been selected, since it most closely resembles the existing. There are no proposed alterations to the fascia, soffit, or gutters.

Betsy Tubbs, Parks and Recreation Department, was in attendance to answer questions.

Staff made a recommendation for approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness to install a new roof at 630 East 7th Street in accordance with the submitted material.

The project was reviewed for conformance with the Standards for Review, Chapter 14.01.060 C and D of the Davenport Municipal Code. The project meets the following standards:

1. Every reasonable effort shall be made to make the minimal number of changes necessary to maintain a designated property in a good state of repair, thereby minimizing the impact of the proposed alteration.
2. Deteriorated architectural features should, where possible, be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical or pictorial evidence

Motion by Powers, second by Franken, to approve Case COA23-13. Motion to approve passed by a roll call vote (5-0).

- G. Case COA23-14: Request to install new signage at 131 West 2nd Street. The J.H.C. Petersen and Sons Building is a locally listed historic landmark. Endeavor Management Group LLC, petitioner. [Ward 3]

Werderitch introduced the proposed sign package for a new restaurant and bar occupying the first-floor tenant space. Kendall Deter, applicant, was in attendance to answer questions about the project.

Staff recommended approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of new signage at 131 West 2nd Street per Chapter 14.01.060 of the Zoning Ordinance.

The project was reviewed for conformance with the Standards for Review, Chapter 14.01.060.C and D. The project meets the following standards:

1. Every reasonable effort shall be made to make the minimal number of changes necessary to maintain a designated property in a good state of repair, thereby minimizing the impact of the proposed alteration.
2. The height of the proposed projecting sign is compatible with the designated property and the surrounding structures.
3. Site improvements should have as minimal of an impact as possible to the designated property's original layout and its visual character.

Motion by Hustedde, second by Miranda, to approve Case COA23-14 with the following condition: If the east wall sign is removed, then the property owner shall repair the façade to its original condition prior to installation. Motion to approve Case COA23-14 with the added condition passed by a roll call vote (4-1). Commissioner Powers voting against the motion.

VI. Other Business

A. 2023 Quad Cities Henry Farnam Dinner

The Commission discussed attending the 2023 Quad Cities Henry Farnam Dinner and running a display table. Commissioners will check their availability and confirm interest at the April 11th meeting.

VII. Open Forum for Comment

Commissioner Franken provided an update on the collaboration with the Davenport School District.

Werderitch stated that revising the Historic Preservation Commission Bylaws is included on the Certified Local Government Work Plan for 2023. This is a project that requires coordination with the City's Legal Department. Staff anticipate this taking place in the second half of 2023. Gleason discussed the process of updating bylaws. Commissioners expressed a desire for Bylaws to be reviewed during a work session rather than the regular meeting agenda.

VIII. Adjourn

Motion by Franken, second by Miranda, to adjourn the meeting. Motion passed by a voice vote (5-0). The meeting adjourned at 6:40 pm.

IX. Next Commission Meeting: April 11, 2023