

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

CITY OF DAVENPORT, IOWA

TUESDAY, SEPTEMBER 10, 2024; 5:00 PM

CITY HALL | 226 WEST 4TH STREET | COUNCIL CHAMBERS

I. Call to Order

Chairperson Hustedde called the meeting to order.

Present: McGivern, Hustedde, Gomez, Adams, Eaton

Excused: Franken, Kretz

Staff Present: Berkley, Werderitch

II. Secretary's Report

1. Consideration of the August 13, 2024 meeting minutes.

Motion by McGivern, second by Gomez, to approve the August 13, 2024 meeting minutes. Minutes were unanimously approved by voice vote (5-0).

III. Communications

The City welcomed its three newest members. Werderitch provided an update on the Heart of Downtown Davenport Walking Tours and the Gold Coast-Hamburg District 2024 Tour of Homes.

IV. Old Business

V. New Business

1. Case COA24-16: Request for the installation of a new roof at 628 Ripley Street. The William H. and Emma A. Ruser House is located within the Hamburg Local Landmark Historic District. David LaRoque, petitioner. [Ward 3]

Staff introduced the request to install a new roof and gutter system. The proposed replacement product is Owens Corning TruDefinition Duration Shingles, which staff consider to be a replacement in-kind.

Staff made a recommendation to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness to install a new roof at 628 Ripley Street in accordance with the submitted material.

The project was reviewed for conformance with the Standards for Review, Chapter 14.01.060 C and D of the Davenport Municipal Code. The project meets the following standards:

1. Every reasonable effort shall be made to make the minimal number of changes necessary to maintain a designated property in a good state of repair, thereby minimizing the impact of the proposed alteration.

2. Deteriorated architectural features should, where possible, be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical or pictorial evidence.

A representative of the project was in attendance to answer questions on behalf of the property owner.

Motion by McGivern, second by Gomez, to approve Case COA24-16 in accordance with the submitted materials. Motion to approve passed by a roll call vote (5-0).

2. Case COA24-17: Request for the installation of a new roof at 709 Brown Street. The William H. Wiese Residence is located within the Hamburg Local Landmark Historic District. Dawn Santiago, petitioner. [Ward 3]

Staff presented a history of the property and prior Certificate of Appropriateness Application approved in 2021. Due to financial constraints and issues with contractors, the property owner submitted a new application requesting removal of the clay tile roof and installation of an asphalt shingle product. The historic property inventory sheet identifies the roofing material as red clay tile, which is also listed as a defining architectural feature. Red clay tile roofs are uncommon in the City of Davenport, making the preservation of this material imperative. While staff are sympathetic to the higher product and installation cost associated with red clay tile, the replacement asphalt shingle does not convey the same visual appearance. Without the French clay tile roof, the character of the William H. Wiese Residence is diminished.

Staff made a recommendation to deny the Certificate of Appropriateness to install a new roof at 709 Brown Street in accordance with the submitted scope of work.

The project was reviewed for conformance with the Standards for Review, Chapter 14.01.060 C of the Davenport Municipal Code. Switching from a red clay tile roof to an asphalt architectural shingle fails to meet the following standard:

1. Deteriorated architectural features should, where possible, be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical or pictorial evidence.

Dawn and Gabriel Santiago, petitioners, were in attendance to answer questions. The homeowners explained the history of the project and hardships endured with replacing the original clay tile roof.

The Commission inquired about alternative roofing materials that better match the original clay tile, but at a more affordable price point. The Commission advised the homeowner to pursue composite clay tile that visually replicates the appearance, color, and dimensions of the historic tile.

The Santiago's are open to pursuing other roofing products and offered to leave the meeting to retrieve a composite product sample from their house. The Commission agreed to move forward with the agenda and return to this item once the applicant returned.

Motion by McGivern, second by Adams, to take a recess. Motion was unanimously approved by voice vote (5-0).

Motion by Eaton, second by Gomez, to resume the meeting. Motion was unanimously approved by voice vote (5-0).

The Santiago's returned with a sample of the historic clay tile. However, they were unable to locate a material sample of a replica tile. The owners were open to having a discussion with the roof contractor regarding the composite clay tile as a replacement option.

Motion by McGivern, second by Gomez, to table Case COA24-17 to allow the applicant additional time to pursue alternative roofing materials that better replicate the historic appearance of the clay tile. Motion to table Case COA24-17 passed by a roll call vote (5-0).

3. Case DNRHP24-01: Request for demolition of the detached garage at 739 Perry Street. The Roslyn Flats is individually listed on the National Register of Historic Places. Palmer College Foundation, petitioner. [Ward 3]

Staff presented an overview of the request. Palmer College of Chiropractic purchased the 13-unit apartment building in 2023 for the purpose of providing additional student housing. The request is to demolish the existing garage at the rear of the site to facilitate a more efficient parking layout for the residents. According to County records, the 24' by 60' (1,440 square foot) garage was constructed in 1925, nearly 25 years after the construction of the apartment building. The garage appears to be a concrete block surfaced with stucco. It is in a state of deterioration with cracked and failing walls.

Greg Govey, Studio 483 Architects, was in attendance to answer questions on behalf of Palmer College.

Staff recommended that the Historic Preservation Commission approve demolition of the detached garage at 739 Perry Street.

Findings:

1. The detached garage does not meet the criteria in Section 14.040.B of the Davenport Municipal Code.
2. The detached garage does not embody the distinctive architectural characteristics of the original structure, nor does it represent the work of a master builder or architect.

Motion by Eaton, second by Adams, to approve Case DNRHP24-01 in accordance with the submitted materials. Motion to approve passed by a roll call vote (5-0).

VI. Other Business

VII. Open Forum for Comment

The City welcomed its three newest members and gave introductions.

VIII. Adjourn

Motion by McGivern, second by Gomez, to adjourn the meeting. Motion passed by a voice vote (5-0). The meeting adjourned at 6:01pm.

IX. Next Commission Meeting: October 8, 2024